



UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE INTERNATIONAL EXAMINATIONS
General Certificate of Education
Advanced Subsidiary Level and Advanced Level

THINKING SKILLS

9694/23

Paper 2 Critical Thinking

May/June 2013

1 hour 45 minutes

Additional Materials: Answer Booklet/Paper

READ THESE INSTRUCTIONS FIRST

If you have been given an Answer Booklet, follow the instructions on the front cover of the booklet.

Write your Centre number, candidate number and name on all the work you hand in.

Write in dark blue or black pen.

Do not use staples, paper clips, highlighters, glue or correction fluid.

DO NOT WRITE IN ANY BARCODES.

Answer **all** the questions.

Start each question on a new answer sheet.

At the end of the examination, fasten all your work securely together.

The number of marks is given in brackets [] at the end of each question.

This document consists of **6** printed pages and **2** blank pages.



- 1 Study the evidence and answer the questions that follow.

Source A**Account**

of an incident by Mike Brown, visitor to the area

One evening, I was walking up a path to a popular viewing point. A large dog ran up and started leaping around me, barking and pushing at my back. The owner was calling the dog but this had little effect. When the dog was eventually leashed, the owner was not particularly apologetic and seemed to think this sort of thing was normal 'in the country'. On the contrary, one would have thought that one should not be confronted by dangerously out of control dogs when going for a country walk.

Source B**Notice**

at beginning of path

Dogs should be kept on a leash
and under close control at all times.
Failure to observe this rule
may lead to a fine of \$150.

Source C**Account**

of the same incident by Russ Smallpiece, owner of the dog and local resident

I was taking my usual evening walk with my dog, Warrior, when I spotted a man walking ahead. The dog ran up to him in its usual friendly way and this guy went berserk, flapping his arms all over the place. The dog thought he was playing and this made the dog more excited and it started leaping up. I called the dog and it came back to me. I think people who go for walks in the country should be used to meeting dogs and know how to handle them. Had it been a child or someone elderly, I would have restrained the dog earlier.

Source D**Account**

by runner who witnessed this incident

I was doing my usual run one evening a few weeks ago, when I saw a large dog in the distance leaping around a man and pushing at his back with its paws. The dog was barking, but in a friendly way, and seemed to be playing. The owner called the dog back, and it eventually responded and was on its leash by the time I drew level. An argument seemed to be going on between the dog's owner and the walker. I didn't know the walker but the dog's owner, Russ, is a colleague of mine.

Source E**Report***by local dog warden*

I have had a number of complaints about out of control dogs on the popular footpath up to Lake View. No serious harm has resulted and nobody has been bitten. However, dogs, like all animals, can be unpredictable. Owners have no excuse to be complacent about what their animals are capable of, especially as a common reason for buying them is to act as guard dogs to protect family and property.

- (a) What is the relevance of the information in Source B? [3]
- (b) How useful is the evidence given by the runner in Source D? [3]
- (c) How useful is the evidence in Source E? [3]
- (d) How likely is it that the dog was 'dangerously out of control'?
Write a short, reasoned argument to support your conclusion, with critical reference to the evidence provided and considering plausible alternative scenarios. [6]

2 Study the evidence and answer the questions that follow.

Source A

Extract

from newspaper article on the Hudson-Cragport Toll Bridge

Hudson and Cragport are two large towns divided by a river estuary one kilometre wide. For centuries, the only road link between the two communities was the old bridge at the head of the estuary, a distance of some 25 kilometres. A suspension bridge was eventually built across

the estuary to link the two communities. Many people argue that the new bridge has not given value for money. It is not on a major national road route and since the early years after it opened its use has declined.

Source B

Extract

from statement by authority responsible for building the Hudson-Cragport Toll Bridge

The new bridge connected, both socially and economically, two previously remote and insular areas of the country, improving communication and so enabling the area to realise its potential in commercial, industrial and tourist development.

It has saved many millions of vehicle-kilometres and many valuable hours of drivers' and passengers' time – an important factor, not only for the drivers and operators of commercial vehicles, but also for tourists and holidaymakers who would have had to travel around the estuary to reach destinations in the region.

Source C

Letter

to editor of local paper

Many local people still drive around the estuary to get to the other side. It is a good road and only takes 25 minutes, in comparison with 10 minutes to go via the bridge when queuing to pay the toll is taken into account. The amount of the toll does not justify a saving of 15 minutes journey time. Building the bridge was a massive mistake.

Source D

Extract

from 'History of the Hudson-Cragport Toll Bridge'

If the planning and financing of the bridge were difficult, its construction, which began in 1973, was worse. The geology of the area, particularly on the south bank, caused many lengthy and costly delays, as did strikes and bad weather. Because the south tower is set into the river bed, it took a lot more work to build, and suffered more setbacks, than the relatively simple land-based north tower.

Source E

Traffic figures for the Hudson-Cragport Toll Bridge

<i>Year</i>	<i>Cars</i>	<i>Lorries</i>	<i>Exempt from paying toll</i>
1999/00	5 101 163	150 352	212 839
2000/01	4 914 832	142 850	212 097
2001/02	5 074 899	130 969	229 445
2002/03	5 310 783	128 568	234 410
2003/04	5 391 743	121 891	266 089
2004/05	5 476 259	117 430	270 399
2005/06	5 486 438	120 148	290 818
2006/07	5 550 908	115 138	295 320
2007/08	5 702 543	114 462	296 887
2008/09	5 613 180	104 083	297 007
2009/10	5 579 029	109 681	319 375

- (a) To what extent do the statements in Source B justify the building of the bridge? [4]
- (b) What impact would the additional information that Hudson has a major accident and emergency hospital have on the statement in Source C that “building the bridge was a massive mistake”? [3]
- (c) Is Source D an argument? Briefly explain your answer. [2]
- (d) ‘Building the bridge was not worthwhile.’
How justified is this opinion? Write a short, reasoned argument to support your conclusion, using and evaluating the information provided in Sources A – E. [6]

3 Read the passage and answer the questions below.

- 1 We live in an age of sophisticated mass communications, such as email and video-conferencing. Some people have suggested businesses should use such technology in order to cut down on the amount of face-to-face meetings and unnecessary air travel. This would make a significant contribution to reducing environmentally harmful emissions, it is argued. However, this technology will never be an adequate substitute for meeting people face-to-face, as such meetings are essential to businesses.
- 2 We may be able to see and hear people using technology such as video-conferencing, but what about our other senses of smell, taste and touch? Since we have five senses in order to get to grips with the world then we are clearly disadvantaged if we can only use two of them. Remote communication technology deprives us of our full range of mental faculties.
- 3 Whilst environmentalists target air travel, planes only contribute about 5% of all emissions into the atmosphere. Factories, particularly in the developing world, make a far more significant contribution to harmful pollution. Those who wish to tackle global warming would be better to target this problem.
- 4 An event such as a family reunion would not be the same if it was conducted using technology like video-conferencing. This technology cannot replicate the warmth of a genuine family reunion, where people meet each other in a special location and, for example, share a meal together.
- 5 Equally, people would feel uneasy if crucial negotiations such as international peace treaties were undertaken in a remote way. This is because negotiators in these situations need to get to know each other so that a 'personal chemistry' grows up between them. It is difficult to imagine the Camp David agreement, which led to a peace treaty between Egypt and Israel, being successful if the negotiators had relied on video-conferencing.

- (a) Using the exact words from the passage as far as possible, identify the main conclusion. [2]
- (b) Using the exact words from the passage as far as possible, identify **three** reasons used to support the main conclusion. [3]
- (c) Evaluate the strength of the reasoning in the argument. In your answer you should consider any flaws, unstated assumptions and other weaknesses. [5]
- (d) 'Email has increased efficiency in the workplace.'
Write your own short argument to support **or** challenge this claim. The conclusion of your argument must be stated. [5]

BLANK PAGE

Permission to reproduce items where third-party owned material protected by copyright is included has been sought and cleared where possible. Every reasonable effort has been made by the publisher (UCLES) to trace copyright holders, but if any items requiring clearance have unwittingly been included, the publisher will be pleased to make amends at the earliest possible opportunity.

University of Cambridge International Examinations is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group. Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.