
THINKING SKILLS

9694/23

Paper 2 Critical Thinking

May/June 2015

1 hour 45 minutes

No Additional Materials are required.

READ THESE INSTRUCTIONS FIRST

An answer booklet is provided inside this question paper. You should follow the instructions on the front cover of the answer booklet. If you need additional answer paper ask the invigilator for a continuation booklet.

Answer **all** the questions.

The number of marks is given in brackets [] at the end of each question.

This document consists of **6** printed pages, **2** blank pages and **1** insert.

- 1 Study the evidence and answer the questions that follow.

Source A**Newspaper report**

The Millennium Museum suffered a major loss yesterday when a Chinese Ming vase worth \$50 000 was accidentally broken. The manager of the museum had seen the vase in its usual place in a corner at the top of some stairs at 3 pm when he was doing his rounds. At 3.30 pm a highly agitated member of staff came to him and told him that the vase had been discovered smashed to pieces. The manager told us that investigations had narrowed the field down to two key suspects.

Source B**Statement**

by Andy Jones, part-time student worker at the museum

I saw a mother with a badly behaved child in the museum around the time the vase must have been damaged. The child was running around out of control and I heard the mother say that if he wasn't careful he would knock something over like he had done in the supermarket the week before. I understand you have interviewed a Mrs Smith who claims that the mother had full control of the child. However, I observed Mrs Smith talking to the mother when they were both queuing for the toilet, so they are probably friends.

Source C**Statement**

by mother of the child

I saw Andy Jones at around 3.15 pm. I understand he is a part-time worker at the museum. I recognised him because he used to go to the same school as my elder son. He was looking very flustered and I noticed his hand was bleeding. I remember my son saying he was rather clumsy and was always bumping into things.

Source D**Statement**

by Mrs Smith

I understand that the finger of suspicion for the broken vase is being pointed at a mother and a child who were in the museum at the time. I observed this lady in the queue for the toilets at around 3.10 pm and remember being struck by what a good relationship she had with her child. It is typical that mothers and children immediately get the blame if something like this happens. Surely the whole point of museums is to educate children.

Source E**Letter**

*from college principal to Andy Jones
received on the day of the accident*

You have missed three seminars and you are behind with your written work. Informal reports suggest that you are spending too much time going to parties and getting up late. You should take this letter as a final warning. A failure to change your attitude will lead to dismissal from the college. This would be regrettable as your laboratory work earlier in the course suggested you had some promise as a scientist.

- (a) How significant is Andy Jones' evidence that he observed Mrs Smith talking to the mother?
(Source B) [3]
- (b) How useful is Mrs Smith's evidence in Source D? [3]
- (c) How relevant is the evidence in Source E in assessing Andy Jones's possible guilt? [3]
- (d) Which of the two key suspects is more likely to have caused the vase to be smashed?

Write a short, reasoned argument to support your conclusion, with critical reference to the evidence provided and considering a plausible alternative conclusion. [6]

2 Study the evidence and answer the questions that follow.

Source A

There are two main theories of why good street lighting may discourage crime. The first suggests that better lighting leads to increased surveillance of potential offenders (both by improving visibility and by increasing the number of people on the street), which deters them. The second suggests that better lighting improves the image of an area, leading to increased community pride, community cohesiveness and informal social control.

Source B

A key way of conserving world energy supplies would be to limit the amount of street lighting in towns and cities. Critics of this idea argue that it would encourage crime. However, crime usually occurs when there are few (if any) witnesses, and so the lighting levels are irrelevant. Lighting can show up potential targets, security lapses and even escape routes. Lighting can help criminals see what they are doing, minimising any risk to themselves. Finally, lights can hide criminal activity with glare, providing ideal cover for a burglar by blinding potential witnesses. They can also obscure security camera images.

Source C

Some people disagree with the idea that street lighting discourages crime. Instead, they say that a lack of street lighting causes a fear of crime rather than an increase in actual crime. However, studies have shown that crime decreases in neighbourhoods where there is a mix of ages and social classes out on the streets. Reducing the fear of crime encourages all types of people to go out at night. Restaurants and other businesses benefit from such a night time economy where there is such a social mix.

Source D

The fact that so many offences take place after dark does not necessarily mean they have been caused by inadequate lighting. Street crime tends to occur in leisure-time contexts, often taking place when people – both offenders and victims – have gone out to enjoy themselves and where inhibitions are loosened. A study of 550 offences involving violence or public disruption in a city in the UK showed that almost half occurred between 6.00 pm on Friday and 6.00 pm on Sunday. This is the main time of the week when people are at leisure.

Source E

Numbers of crimes in an area before and after street lighting was installed in 2003

<i>Year</i>	<i>Burglary</i>	<i>Assault</i>	<i>Car theft</i>	<i>Criminal Damage</i>
2001	50	76	78	90
2002	45	70	68	80
2003	52	78	69	92
2004	30	35	50	45
2005	25	30	40	35
2006	22	25	35	30

Source F

There are a number of negative consequences of street lighting. Light pollution means that the night sky cannot be studied effectively by astronomers. Wildlife is disorientated as to whether it is night or day. Lighting may damage health, particularly where all-night street lighting causes sleep disturbance. The correlation between lack of sleep and poor physical as well as psychological health is now well-established. Finally, street lighting is extremely expensive to install, run and maintain.

- (a) Is the passage in Source C an argument? Explain your answer. [2]
- (b) Source A suggests that increased community pride can reduce crime. Does this give sufficient grounds for the installation of street lighting? [3]
- (c) Look at Source E. Suggest **four** factors that could account for the decline in crime after 2003 **other than** the installation of street lighting. [4]
- (d) ‘Good street lighting makes a major contribution to crime control.’

How justified is this statement? Write a short, reasoned argument to support your conclusion, using and evaluating the information provided in Sources A–F. [6]

3 *Read the passage and answer the questions below.*

- 1 Many drivers now rely on satellite navigation systems (satnav) in order to guide them to their destination. Whilst hailed as a key advance by technological geeks, we should regret its introduction; it is a most unwelcome invention.
- 2 As people have come to rely on satnav, they have lost the ability to read maps. This most useful skill has traditionally been taught in geography lessons. All this learning is now going to waste as drivers do not need to bother with maps. They can look and listen to their satnav instead. If they used maps, drivers would not suffer from the distracting effects of satnav. They could plan their journey in advance and arrive at their destination safely, free from distraction. Discouraging the use of satnav would make a positive contribution to road safety.
- 3 Because of the visual aspect of satnav, drivers will look at it, rather than the road. This is particularly the case at busy and complicated road junctions in cities, where driving requires full concentration. It represents a hazard to other road users. Compared to cars in the past, modern cars already have a multitude of instruments that drivers need to look at. They do not need yet another one to add to the distraction. The modern car's instrument panel now resembles something that would be more appropriate in an aeroplane. Manufacturers only include this array of dials and flashing lights to make the car look more impressive.
- 4 Satnav frequently makes mistakes. For example, it often fails to indicate where a river crossing is by ferry and some motorists, over-reliant on their satnav, have been known to drive off jetties into the water. It also takes motorists on the shortest route, which is not always the one most suitable as regards road width. There have been many cases of heavy goods vehicles (HGVs) getting stuck on narrow roads as a result of drivers following instructions from their satnavs.

- (a) Using the exact words from the passage as far as possible, identify the main conclusion. [2]
- (b) Using the exact words from the passage as far as possible, identify **three** reasons which directly support the main conclusion. [3]
- (c) Evaluate the strength of the reasoning in the argument. In your answer you should consider any flaws, unstated assumptions and other weaknesses. [5]
- (d) 'Young people should be encouraged to travel.'

Write your own short argument to support **or** challenge this claim. The conclusion of your argument must be stated. Credit will not be given for repeating ideas from the passage. [5]

BLANK PAGE

Permission to reproduce items where third-party owned material protected by copyright is included has been sought and cleared where possible. Every reasonable effort has been made by the publisher (UCLES) to trace copyright holders, but if any items requiring clearance have unwittingly been included, the publisher will be pleased to make amends at the earliest possible opportunity.

To avoid the issue of disclosure of answer-related information to candidates, all copyright acknowledgements are reproduced online in the Cambridge International Examinations Copyright Acknowledgements Booklet. This is produced for each series of examinations and is freely available to download at www.cie.org.uk after the live examination series.

Cambridge International Examinations is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group. Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.